

STATE OF FLORIDA
DIVISION OF ADMINISTRATIVE HEARINGS

BARBARA REYES, on behalf of and
as parent and natural guardian
of ASHLEY MONZON, a minor,

Petitioner,

vs.

Case No. 16-5498N

FLORIDA BIRTH-RELATED
NEUROLOGICAL INJURY COMPENSATION
ASSOCIATION,

Respondent.

_____ /

SUMMARY FINAL ORDER OF DISMISSAL

This cause came on for consideration upon a Motion for Summary Final Order filed by Respondent, Florida Birth-Related Neurological Injury Compensation Association (NICA), on November 2, 2016.

STATEMENT OF THE CASE

On September 14, 2016, Petitioner, Barbara Reyes, on behalf of and as parent and natural guardian of Ashley Monzon (Ashley), a minor, filed a Petition for Benefits Pursuant to Florida Statute Section 766.301 et seq. (Petition) with the Division of Administrative Hearings (DOAH) for a determination of compensability under the Florida Birth-Related Neurological Injury Compensation Plan (Plan). The Petition named Lorena Tinoco, M.D., as the physician who provided obstetric

services for the birth of Ashley on July 31, 2013, at West Kendall Baptist Hospital in Miami, Florida.

DOAH served NICA with the Petition on September 23, 2016. On October 3, 2016, DOAH received a return receipt from the United States Postal Service showing that West Kendall Baptist Hospital was served with a copy of the Petition. DOAH served a copy of the Petition on Lorena Tinoco, M.D., on September 28, 2016. As of the date of this Summary Final Order of Dismissal, neither West Kendall Baptist Hospital nor Dr. Tinoco has petitioned to intervene into this proceeding.

On November 2, 2016, NICA filed a Motion for Summary Final Order, requesting that a summary final order be entered finding that the claim was not compensable because Ashley did not sustain a "birth-related neurological injury" as that term is defined in section 766.302(2), Florida Statutes. Petitioner did not file a response to the Motion.

On November 16, 2016, an Order to Show Cause was entered which allowed Petitioner until December 1, 2016, to inform the undersigned in writing as to why the motion should not be granted and a summary final order be entered finding Petitioner's claim is not compensable. To date, no response has been filed by Petitioner to the Motion or to the Order to Show Cause.

FINDINGS OF FACT

1. Ashley Monzon was born on July 31, 2013, at West Kendall Baptist Hospital in Miami, Florida.

2. Donald Willis, M.D. (Dr. Willis), was requested by NICA to review the medical records for Ashley. In an affidavit dated November 2, 2016, Dr. Willis described his findings in pertinent part as follows:

5. It is my opinion that the prenatal course was essentially uncomplicated. Labor was induced at term. There was not fetal distress during labor. Delivery was complicated by a compound presentation and shoulder dystocia. Bag and mask ventilation and CPAP were required for the first minute of life, but the baby "pinked up quickly" and was discharged home 2 days after birth. The baby was subsequently diagnosed with microcephaly. MRI's were normal. Pediatric Neurology diagnosed Encephalopathy of unknown cause.

6. As such, it is my opinion that there was no apparent obstetrical event that resulted in loss of oxygen or mechanical trauma to the baby's brain during labor, delivery or the immediate post delivery period.

3. A review of the file reveals that no contrary evidence was presented to dispute Dr. Willis' finding that Ashley's injuries were not the result of oxygen deprivation or mechanical trauma during labor, delivery, or the immediate post-delivery period. Dr. Willis' opinion is credited.

CONCLUSIONS OF LAW

4. The Division of Administrative Hearings has jurisdiction over the parties to and the subject matter of these proceedings. §§ 766.301-766.316, Fla. Stat.

5. The Plan was established by the Legislature "for the purpose of providing compensation, irrespective of fault, for birth-related neurological injury claims" relating to births occurring on or after January 1, 1989. § 766.303(1), Fla. Stat.

6. The injured infant, her or his personal representative, parents, dependents, and next of kin may seek compensation under the Plan by filing a claim for compensation with DOAH. §§ 766.302(3), 766.303(2), and 766.305(1), Fla. Stat. NICA, which administers the Plan, has "45 days from the date of service of a complete claim . . . in which to file a response to the petition and to submit relevant written information relating to the issue of whether the injury is a birth-related neurological injury." § 766.305(4), Fla. Stat.

7. NICA has determined that Petitioner does not have a claim that is compensable under the Plan and has filed a Motion for Summary Final Order, requesting that an order be entered finding that the claim is not compensable.

8. In ruling on the motion, the administrative law judge must make the following determination based upon the available evidence:

(a) Whether the injury claimed is a birth-related neurological injury. If the claimant has demonstrated, to the satisfaction of the administrative law judge, that the infant has sustained a brain or spinal cord injury caused by oxygen deprivation or mechanical injury and that the infant was thereby rendered permanently and substantially mentally and physically impaired, a rebuttable presumption shall arise that the injury is a birth-related neurological injury as defined in s. 766.303(2).

§ 766.309(1), Fla. Stat.

9. The term "birth-related neurological injury" is defined in section 766.302(2) as follows:

"Birth-related neurological injury" means injury to the brain or spinal cord of a live infant weighing at least 2,500 grams for a single gestation or, in the case of a multiple gestation, a live infant weighing at least 2,000 grams at birth caused by oxygen deprivation or mechanical injury occurring in the course of labor, delivery, or resuscitation in the immediate postdelivery period in a hospital, which renders the infant permanently and substantially mentally and physically impaired.

10. The evidence, which is not refuted, established that there was not an obstetrical event that resulted in loss of oxygen or mechanical trauma to Ashley's brain during labor, delivery or the immediate post-delivery period. Thus, Ashley is not eligible for benefits under the Plan.

CONCLUSION

Based upon the foregoing Findings of Fact and Conclusions of Law, it is ORDERED that the Petition filed by Barbara Reyes, on behalf of and as parent and natural guardian of Ashley Monzon, a minor, is dismissed with prejudice.

DONE AND ORDERED this 8th day of December, 2016, in Tallahassee, Leon County, Florida.



BARBARA J. STAROS
Administrative Law Judge
Division of Administrative Hearings
The DeSoto Building
1230 Apalachee Parkway
Tallahassee, Florida 32399-3060
(850) 488-9675
Fax Filing (850) 921-6847
www.doah.state.fl.us

Filed with the Clerk of the
Division of Administrative Hearings
this 8th day of December, 2016.

COPIES FURNISHED:
(via certified mail)

Kenney Shipley, Executive Director
Florida Birth Related Neurological
Injury Compensation Association
2360 Christopher Place, Suite 1
Tallahassee, Florida 32308
(eServed)
(Certified Mail No. 7015 0640 0001 2705 7034)

Barbara Reyes
Apartment 3
123 Northwest 47 Avenue
Miami, Florida 33126
(Certified Mail No. 7013 1710 0000 1617 1190)

David W. Black, Esquire
Frank, Weinberg & Black, P.L.
7805 Southwest 6th Court
Plantation, Florida 33324
(eServed)
(Certified Mail No. 7013 1710 0000 1617 1206)

Amie Rice, Investigation Manager
Consumer Services Unit
Department of Health
4052 Bald Cypress Way, Bin C-75
Tallahassee, Florida 32399-3275
(Certified Mail No. 7013 1710 0000 1617 1213)

Justin Senior, Interim Secretary
Health Quality Assurance
Agency for Health Care Administration
2727 Mahan Drive, Mail Stop 1
Tallahassee, Florida 32308
(eServed)
(Certified Mail No. 7013 1710 0000 1617 1220)

Lorena Tinoco, M.D.
Suite 304
8200 Southwest 117th Avenue
Miami, Florida 33183
(Certified Mail No. 7013 1710 0000 1617 1237)

West Kendall Baptist Hospital
Attention: Risk Management
9555 Southwest 162nd Avenue
Miami, Florida 33196
(Certified Mail No. 7013 1710 0000 1617 1244)

NOTICE OF RIGHT TO JUDICIAL REVIEW

Review of a final order of an administrative law judge shall be by appeal to the District Court of Appeal pursuant to section 766.311(1), Florida Statutes. Review proceedings are governed by the Florida Rules of Appellate Procedure. Such proceedings are commenced by filing the original notice of administrative appeal with the agency clerk of the Division of Administrative Hearings within 30 days of rendition of the order to be reviewed, and a copy, accompanied by filing fees prescribed by law, with the clerk of the appropriate District Court of Appeal. See § 766.311(1), Fla. Stat., and Fla. Birth-Related Neurological Injury Comp. Ass'n v. Carreras, 598 So. 2d 299 (Fla. 1st DCA 1992).